

[Submitting Counsel on Signature Page]

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA ADOLESCENT  
ADDICTION/PERSONAL INJURY  
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:

4:23-cv-05448

MDL No. 3047

Case No. 4:22-md-03047-YGR

**STATE ATTORNEYS GENERAL'S  
AFFIRMATIVE LETTER BRIEF  
EXPLAINING GROUNDS FOR  
ANTICIPATED MOTIONS FOR  
SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND *DAUBERT*  
MOTIONS**

Judge: Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

Magistrate Judge: Hon. Peter H. Kang

Pursuant to CMO 27 (ECF 2274) and the pre-filing schedules approved in CMO 27 (ECF 2271), the State Attorneys General Plaintiffs ("State AGs") file this letter brief setting forth the bases of their anticipated motions for partial summary judgment and *Daubert*.

**I. Motions For Partial Summary Judgment**

The State AGs propose filing two motions for partial summary judgment regarding Meta's noncompliance with various requirements of the Children's Online Privacy Protection Act ("COPPA").

1. **Anticipated Motion #1:** Meta has violated COPPA by continuing to use the "personal information" of children

COPPA aims to “safeguard the confidentiality, security, and integrity of ... children's personal online information” by requiring “companies that operate websites and online services marketed toward children ... [to] provide certain disclosures about their data collection activities.” *Jones v. Google LLC*, 73 F.4th 636, 641 (9th Cir. 2023). Under COPPA it is unlawful for a website or online service that is “directed to children” or has “actual knowledge” of child users (those under the age of 13) to collect, use, or disclose personal information from those children unless the platform complies with relevant FTC regulations. 15 U.S.C. § 6502(a)(1); 16 C.F.R. § 312.3. ECF 1214 at p. 16.

The State AGs anticipate filing a motion for partial summary judgment establishing that Meta violated COPPA by using children’s personal information [REDACTED]. Discovery has shown that Meta [REDACTED] therefore has “actual knowledge” for COPPA purposes that the users that Meta [REDACTED] are children.

Despite “actual knowledge” that these users are children, Meta has admitted in Rule 30(b)(6) testimony that it [REDACTED] violating COPPA’s requirements.

**2. Anticipated Motion #2: Meta fails to provide COPPA’s required protections to any child users of Facebook and Instagram.**

The State AGs anticipate filing a second motion for partial summary judgment to establish the following elements of COPPA, all of which supported by Meta’s responses to Requests for Admission or otherwise essentially uncontested. Courts routinely grant this type of partial summary judgment on elements or parts of a claim, even short of establishing liability. *See, e.g., State Farm Fire & Cas. Co. v. Geary*, 699 F. Supp. 756, 759 (N.D. Cal. 1987); *Freeman v. Ethicon, Inc.*, 619 F. Supp. 3d 998, 1008 (C.D. Cal. 2022); *Fed. Trade Comm’n v. Surescripts, LLC*, 665 F. Supp. 3d 14, 37–38 (D.D.C. 2023). Granting summary judgment as to these elements will narrow the issues, streamlining the trial and focusing the jury’s attention with respect to Meta’s COPPA liability on the two elements that are actually in dispute: whether Facebook or Instagram (or portions thereof) are “directed to children,” and whether Meta had actual knowledge that its users were children under age 13, separate and apart from those users discussed above with respect to Anticipated Motion #1.

***a. Meta is an “operator” of Instagram and Facebook, which are both websites or “online services.”***

COPPA requires an operator of a website or online service to obtain parental consent before it collects or uses the personal information of a child who is under 13. *See* 15 U.S.C. §§ 6501(1), 6502(a), 6502(b)(1)(A)(ii); 16 C.F.R. § 312.5(a)(1).

Meta’s discovery responses establish that [REDACTED]. Both platforms are indisputably websites or online services.

1  
2 *b. Meta collects “personal information” from users of Facebook and*  
3 *Instagram, including those who visit Facebook and Instagram without*  
4 *logging into an account.*

5 “Personal information” is defined by statute and regulation to mean “individually  
6 identifiable information about an individual collected online,” including the child’s name, address,  
7 email address, personal identifiers, geolocation information, and photographs or videos of the child,  
8 among other categories of information. 15 U.S.C. § 6501(8); 16 C.F.R § 312.2.

9 Discovery responses, [REDACTED] establish [REDACTED]  
10 [REDACTED]  
11 [REDACTED]

12 *c. Meta has not provided COPPA’s protections for any children on*  
13 *Facebook or Instagram.*

14 COPPA requires operators of websites or online services directed to children or those who  
15 have actual knowledge they are collecting or maintaining personal information from children to  
16 provide various protections with respect to children’s personal information.

17 Meta has admitted [REDACTED]  
18 [REDACTED]  
19 [REDACTED]  
20 [REDACTED]  
21 [REDACTED]  
22 [REDACTED]  
23 [REDACTED]  
24 [REDACTED]  
25 [REDACTED]  
26 [REDACTED]  
27 [REDACTED]  
28 [REDACTED]

While Meta presumably disputes that it was required to provide COPPA’s protections to

1 children on Facebook and Instagram, there is no dispute as to the material fact that Meta provided  
2 none of the [REDACTED] protections [REDACTED] to any children or their parents. Summary judgment should be  
3 granted to establish these elements of the State AGs' COPPA claim.

## 4 **II. *Daubert* Motion**

5 The State AGs do not anticipate filing Daubert motions related to Meta's responsive experts  
6 Emilio Ferrera, Jeremy Birnholtz, Sriraman Venkataraman, Kevin Keller, and Bruce Isaacson to  
7 MDL State AGs experts Ravi Iyer and Adam Alter. However, the State AG's reserve all rights to  
8 seek to exclude opinions from these experts through Motions before trial. As flagged in a prior  
9 letter brief identifying potential motions this Court may see from the State AGs (ECF 2172), the  
10 State AGs anticipate filing Motions to exclude expert opinions that provide opinions on topics not  
11 at issue or no longer at issue in this case, such as opinions that primarily relate to content moderation  
12 or opinions responding to issues that have not been raised within the MDL State AG case.  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 **Dated: November 19, 2025**

2 Respectfully submitted,

3  
4 **KRIS MAYES**  
Attorney General  
5 State of Arizona

6 /s/ Reagan Healey  
7 Reagan Healey (AZ No. 038733), pro hac vice  
Assistant Attorney General  
8 Arizona Attorney General's Office  
2005 North Central Avenue  
9 Phoenix, AZ 85004  
Phone: (602) 542-3725  
10 Fax: (602) 542-4377  
11 [Reagan.Healey@azag.gov](mailto:Reagan.Healey@azag.gov)  
12 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Arizona, ex rel.*  
*Kris Mayes, Attorney General*

13 **PHILIP J. WEISER**  
14 Attorney General  
15 State of Colorado

16 /s/ Lauren M. Dickey  
17 Lauren M. Dickey (CO Reg. No. 45773)  
First Assistant Attorney General  
18 Megan Paris Rundlet (CO Reg. No. 27474)  
Senior Assistant Solicitor General  
19 Elizabeth Orem (CO Reg. No. 58309)  
Assistant Attorney General  
20 Colorado Department of Law  
Ralph L. Carr Judicial Center  
21 Consumer Protection Section  
1300 Broadway, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
22 Denver, CO 80203  
Phone: (720) 508-6651  
23 [lauren.dickey@coag.gov](mailto:lauren.dickey@coag.gov)  
24  
25 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado, ex rel.*  
*Philip J. Weiser, Attorney General*

**ROB BONTA**  
Attorney General  
State of California

/s/ Megan O'Neill  
Nicklas A. Akers (CA SBN 211222)  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
Bernard Eskandari (CA SBN 244395)  
Emily Kalanithi (CA SBN 256972)  
Supervising Deputy Attorneys General  
Megan O'Neill (CA SBN 343535)  
Nayha Arora (CA SBN 350467)  
Joshua Olszewski-Jubelirer  
(CA SBN 336428)  
Marissa Roy (CA SBN 318773)  
Brendan Ruddy (CA SBN 297896)  
Deputy Attorneys General  
California Department of Justice  
Office of the Attorney General  
455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000  
San Francisco, CA 94102-7004  
Phone: (415) 510-4400  
Fax: (415) 703-5480  
[megan.oneill@doj.ca.gov](mailto:megan.oneill@doj.ca.gov)  
  
*Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State*  
*of California*

**RAÚL R. LABRADOR**  
Attorney General  
State of Idaho

/s/ James J. Simeri  
James J. Simeri (ID Bar No. 12332)  
pro hac vice  
Deputy Attorney General  
Attorney General's Office  
P.O. Box 83720  
Boise, ID 83720-0010  
(208) 334-2424  
[james.simeri@ag.idaho.gov](mailto:james.simeri@ag.idaho.gov)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Idaho*

**WILLIAM TONG**  
Attorney General  
State of Connecticut

/s/ Rebecca Borné  
Rebecca Borné  
(CT Juris No. 446982), *pro hac vice*  
Tess E. Schneider  
(CT Juris No. 444175), *pro hac vice*  
Krislyn M. Launer  
(CT Juris No. 440789), *pro hac vice*  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Connecticut Office of the Attorney General  
165 Capitol Avenue  
Hartford, Connecticut 06106  
Phone: 860-808-5400  
Fax: 860-808-5593  
[Rebecca.Borne@ct.gov](mailto:Rebecca.Borne@ct.gov)  
[Tess.Schneider@ct.gov](mailto:Tess.Schneider@ct.gov)  
[Krislyn.Launer@ct.gov](mailto:Krislyn.Launer@ct.gov)

**KATHLEEN JENNINGS**  
Attorney General  
State of Delaware

/s/ Ryan Costa  
Marion M. Quirk (DE Bar 4136), *pro hac vice*  
Director of Consumer Protection  
Ryan T. Costa (DE Bar 5325), *pro hac vice*  
Deputy Director of Consumer Protection  
Delaware Department of Justice  
820 N. French Street, 5th Floor  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
Phone: (302) 683-8811  
[Marion.Quirk@delaware.gov](mailto:Marion.Quirk@delaware.gov)  
[Ryan.Costa@delaware.gov](mailto:Ryan.Costa@delaware.gov)

*Attorneys for State of Delaware, ex rel.  
Kathleen Jennings, Attorney General  
for the State of Delaware*

**THEODORE E. ROKITA**  
Attorney General  
State of Indiana

/s/ Scott L. Barnhart  
Scott L. Barnhart (IN Atty No. 25474-82),  
*pro hac vice*  
Chief Counsel and Director of Consumer  
Protection  
Corinne Gilchrist (IN Atty No. 27115-53),  
*pro hac vice*  
Section Chief, Consumer Litigation  
Mark M. Snodgrass (IN Atty No. 29495-49),  
*pro hac vice*  
Deputy Attorney General  
Office of the Indiana Attorney General  
Indiana Government Center South  
302 West Washington St., 5th Floor  
Indianapolis, IN 46203  
Telephone: (317) 232-6309  
[Scott.Barnhart@atg.in.gov](mailto:Scott.Barnhart@atg.in.gov)  
[Corinne.Gilchrist@atg.in.gov](mailto:Corinne.Gilchrist@atg.in.gov)  
[Mark.Snodgrass@atg.in.gov](mailto:Mark.Snodgrass@atg.in.gov)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Indiana*

**KRIS W. KOBACH**  
Attorney General  
State of Kansas

/s/ Sarah M. Dietz  
Sarah M. Dietz, Assistant Attorney General  
(KS Bar No. 27457), *pro hac vice*  
Kaley Schrader, Assistant Attorney General  
(KS Bar No. 27700), *pro hac vice*  
Office of the Attorney General  
120 SW 10th Avenue, 2nd Floor  
Topeka, Kansas 66612  
Telephone: (785) 296-3751  
Fax: (785) 296-3131  
Email: [sarah.dietz@ag.ks.gov](mailto:sarah.dietz@ag.ks.gov)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Kansas*



**ANNE E. LOPEZ**  
Attorney General  
State of Hawai‘i

/s/ Douglas S. Chin  
Christopher J.I. Leong (HI JD No. 9662), *pro hac vice*  
Supervising Deputy Attorney General  
Kelcie K. Nagata (HI JD No. 10649), *pro hac vice*  
Deputy Attorney General  
Department of the Attorney General  
Commerce and Economic Development Division  
425 Queen Street  
Honolulu, Hawai‘i 96813  
Phone: (808) 586-1180

[Christopher.ji.leong@hawaii.gov](mailto:Christopher.ji.leong@hawaii.gov)  
[Kelcie.k.nagata@hawaii.gov](mailto:Kelcie.k.nagata@hawaii.gov)

Douglas S. Chin (HI JD No. 6465), *pro hac vice*  
John W. Kelly (HI JD No. 9907), *pro hac vice*  
Special Deputy Attorney General  
Starn O’Toole Marcus & Fisher  
733 Bishop Street, Suite 1900  
Honolulu, Hawai‘i 96813  
Phone: (808) 537-6100  
[dchin@starnlaw.com](mailto:dchin@starnlaw.com)  
[jkelly@starnlaw.com](mailto:jkelly@starnlaw.com)

**KWAME RAOUL**  
Attorney General  
State of Illinois

/s/ Matthew Davies  
Susan Ellis, Chief, Consumer Protection  
Division (IL Bar No. 6256460), *pro hac vice*  
Greg Grzeskiewicz, Chief, Consumer  
Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No. 6272322), *pro hac vice*  
Jacob Gilbert, Deputy Chief, Consumer Fraud  
Bureau (IL Bar No. 6306019), *pro hac vice*  
Matthew Davies, Supervising Attorney,  
Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No. 6299608),  
*pro hac vice*  
Adam Sokol, Senior Assistant Attorney

**LIZ MURRILL**  
Attorney General  
State of Louisiana

/s/ Asyl Nachabe  
Asyl Nachabe (LA Bar No. 38846)  
*Pro hac vice*  
Assistant Attorney General  
Louisiana Department of Justice  
Public Protection Division  
Consumer Protection Section  
1885 N 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Baton Rouge, LA 70802  
Tel: (225) 326-6438  
NachabeA@ag.louisiana.gov

*Attorney for State of Louisiana*

**AARON M. FREY**  
Attorney General  
State of Maine

/s/ Michael Devine  
Michael Devine, Maine Bar No. 5048,  
*pro hac vice*  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Maine Attorney General  
6 State House Station  
Augusta, ME 04333  
(207) 626-8800  
michael.devine@maine.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Maine*

**KEITH ELLISON**  
Attorney General  
State of Minnesota

/s/ Caitlin Micko  
Caitlin Micko (MN Bar No. 0395388),  
*pro hac vice*  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Minnesota Attorney General  
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1200  
St. Paul, MN 55101-2130  
Tel: (651) 724-9180

General, Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No. 6216883), *pro hac vice*  
 Emily Maria Migliore, Assistant Attorney General, Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No. 6336392), *pro hac vice*  
 Daniel B. Roth, Assistant Attorney General, Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No. 6290613), *pro hac vice*  
 Meera Khan, Assistant Attorney General, Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No. 6345895), *pro hac vice*  
 Office of the Illinois Attorney General  
 115 S. LaSalle Street  
 Chicago, Illinois 60603  
 312-814-8554  
 Susan.Ellis@ilag.gov  
 Greg.Grzeskiewicz@ilag.gov  
 Jacob.Gilbert@ilag.gov  
 Matthew.Davies@ilag.gov  
 Adam.Sokol@ilag.gov  
 Emily.Migliore@ilag.gov  
 Daniel.Roth@ilag.gov  
 Meera.Khan@ilag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State of Illinois*

**RUSSELL COLEMAN**

Attorney General  
 Commonwealth of Kentucky

/s/ Philip R. Heleringer

J. Christian Lewis (KY Bar No. 87109), *pro hac vice*  
 Philip Heleringer (KY Bar No. 96748), *pro hac vice*  
 Zachary Richards (KY Bar No. 99209), *pro hac vice app. forthcoming*  
 Daniel I. Keiser (KY Bar No. 100264), *pro hac vice*  
 Assistant Attorneys General  
 1024 Capital Center Drive, Ste. 200  
 Frankfort, KY 40601  
 Christian.Lewis@ky.gov  
 Philip.Heleringer@ky.gov

caitlin.micko@ag.state.mn.us

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Minnesota, by its Attorney General, Keith Ellison*

**MATTHEW J. PLATKIN**

Attorney General  
 State of New Jersey

By: /s/ Thomas Huynh

Kashif T. Chand (NJ Bar No. 016752008), *pro hac vice*  
 Assistant Attorney General  
 Thomas Huynh (NJ Bar No. 200942017), *Pro hac vice*  
 Assistant Section Chief, Deputy Attorney General  
 Verna J. Pradaxay (NJ Bar No. 335822021), *Pro hac vice*  
 Mandy K. Wang (NJ Bar No. 373452021), *Pro hac vice*  
 Deputy Attorneys General  
 New Jersey Office of the Attorney General,  
 Division of Law  
 124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor  
 Newark, NJ 07101  
 Tel: (973) 648-2052  
 Kashif.Chand@law.njoag.gov  
 Thomas.Huynh@law.njoag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Matthew J. Platkin, Attorney General for the State of New Jersey, and Elizabeth Harris, Acting Director of the New Jersey Division of Consumer Affairs*



Zach.Richards@ky.gov  
 Daniel.Keiser@ky.gov  
 Phone: (502) 696-5300  
 Fax: (502) 564-2698

*Attorneys for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of Kentucky*

**ANTHONY G. BROWN**  
 Attorney General  
 State of Maryland

/s/ Elizabeth J. Stern  
 Philip D. Ziperman (Maryland CPF No. 9012190379), *pro hac vice*  
 Deputy Chief, Consumer Protection Division  
 Elizabeth J. Stern (Maryland CPF No. 1112090003), *pro hac vice*  
 Assistant Attorney General  
 Office of the Attorney General of Maryland  
 200 St. Paul Place  
 Baltimore, MD 21202  
 Phone: (410) 576-6417 (Mr. Ziperman)  
 Phone: (410) 576-7226 (Ms. Stern)  
 Fax: (410) 576-6566  
 pziperman@oag.state.md.us  
 estern@oag.state.md.us

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Office of the Attorney General of Maryland*

**MICHAEL T. HILGERS**  
 Attorney General  
 State of Nebraska

/s/ Benjamin Swanson  
 Benjamin Swanson (NE #27675)  
 Assistant Attorney General  
 Consumer Protection Bureau  
 Phone: (402) 417-7759  
 Email: benjamin.swanson@nebraska.gov

Anna Anderson (NE #28080)  
 Assistant Attorney General  
 Consumer Protection Bureau  
 Phone: (402) 471-2682

**LETITIA JAMES**  
 Attorney General  
 State of New York

/s/ Christopher D'Angelo  
 Christopher D'Angelo, Chief Deputy Attorney General, Economic Justice Division (NY Bar No. 4348744), *pro hac vice*  
 Christopher.D'Angelo@ag.ny.gov  
 Clark Russell, Deputy Chief, Bureau of Internet and Technology (NY Bar No. 2848323), *pro hac vice*  
 Clark.Russell@ag.ny.gov  
 Nathaniel Kosslyn, Assistant Attorney General (NY Bar No. 5773676), *pro hac vice*  
 Nathaniel.Kosslyn@ag.ny.gov  
 New York Office of the Attorney General  
 28 Liberty Street  
 New York, NY 10005  
 (212) 416-8262

*Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State of New York*

**DAVE YOST**  
 Attorney General  
 State of Ohio

/s/ Kevin R. Walsh  
 Melissa G. Wright (Ohio Bar No. 0077843)  
 Section Chief, Consumer Protection Section  
 Melissa.Wright@ohioago.gov  
 Melissa S. Smith (Ohio Bar No. 0083551)  
 Asst. Section Chief, Consumer Protection Section  
 Melissa.S.Smith@ohioago.gov  
 Michael S. Ziegler (Ohio Bar No. 0042206)  
 Principal Assistant Attorney General  
 Michael.Ziegler@ohioago.gov  
 Kevin R. Walsh (Ohio Bar No. 0073999), *pro hac vice*  
 Kevin.Walsh@ohioago.gov  
 Senior Assistant Attorney General  
 30 East Broad Street, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor  
 Columbus, Ohio 43215  
 Tel: 614-466-1031

Email: [anna.anderson@nebraska.gov](mailto:anna.anderson@nebraska.gov)

Office of the Nebraska Attorney General  
2115 State Capitol Building  
Lincoln, NE 68508

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Nebraska*

**JEFF JACKSON**  
Attorney General  
State of North Carolina

/s/ Charles White  
CHARLES G. WHITE (N.C. SBN 57735),  
*pro hac vice*  
Assistant Attorney General  
KUNAL CHOKSI  
Senior Deputy Attorney General  
JOSH ABRAM  
Special Deputy Attorney General  
N.C. Department of Justice  
Post Office Box 629  
Raleigh, North Carolina 27602  
Telephone: (919) 716-6889  
Facsimile: (919) 716-6050  
E-mail: [cwhite@ncdoj.gov](mailto:cwhite@ncdoj.gov)  
*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of North Carolina*

**DAVE SUNDAY**  
Attorney General  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

/s/ Jonathan R. Burns  
Jonathan R. Burns  
Deputy Attorney General  
(PA Bar No. 315206), *pro hac vice*  
Email: [jburns@attorneygeneral.gov](mailto:jburns@attorneygeneral.gov)  
Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General  
Strawberry Square, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Harrisburg, PA 17120  
Tel: 717.787.4530

*Attorneys for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania*

*Attorneys for State of Ohio, ex rel. Attorney General Dave Yost*

**DAN RAYFIELD**  
Attorney General  
State of Oregon

/s/ John Dunbar  
John Dunbar (Oregon Bar No. 842100), *pro hac vice*  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
Oregon Department of Justice  
Consumer Protection Section  
100 SW Market Street  
Portland, Oregon 97201  
Telephone: (971) 673-1880  
Facsimile: (971) 673-1884  
E-mail: [john.dunbar@doj.state.or.us](mailto:john.dunbar@doj.state.or.us)

*Attorneys for State of Oregon, ex rel. Dan Rayfield, Attorney General for the State of Oregon*

**ALAN WILSON**  
Attorney General  
State of South Carolina

/s/ Anna C. Smith  
C. Havird Jones, Jr.  
Senior Assistant Deputy Attorney General  
Jared Q. Libet (S.C. Bar No. 74975),  
*pro hac vice*  
Assistant Deputy Attorney General  
Anna C. Smith (SC Bar No. 104749),  
*pro hac vice*  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the South Carolina Attorney General  
Post Office Box 11549  
Columbia, South Carolina 29211  
[jlibet@scag.gov](mailto:jlibet@scag.gov)  
[annasmith@scag.gov](mailto:annasmith@scag.gov)  
803-734-0536

*Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of South Carolina, ex rel. Alan M. Wilson, in His Official Capacity as Attorney General of the State of South Carolina*

**PETER F. NERONHA**

Attorney General  
State of Rhode Island

/s/ Stephen N. Provazza

Stephen N. Provazza (R.I. Bar No. 10435),  
*pro hac vice*  
Assistant Attorney General  
Rhode Island Office of the Attorney General  
150 South Main St.  
Providence, RI 02903  
Phone: 401-274-4400  
Email: SProvazza@riag.ri.gov

*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Rhode Island*

**JASON S. MIYARES**

Attorney General  
Commonwealth of Virginia

/s/ Joelle E. Gotwals

Steven G. Popp  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Thomas J. Sanford  
Deputy Attorney General  
Richard S. Schweiker, Jr. (VSB No. 34258),  
*pro hac vice*  
Senior Assistant Attorney General and Section  
Chief  
Joelle E. Gotwals (VSB No. 76779),  
*pro hac vice*  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
Chandler P. Crenshaw (VSB No. 93452),  
*pro hac vice*  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General of Virginia  
Consumer Protection Section  
202 N. 9th Street  
Richmond, Virginia 23219  
Telephone: (804) 786-8789  
Facsimile: (804) 786-0122  
E-mail: [jgotwals@oag.state.va.us](mailto:jgotwals@oag.state.va.us)

*Attorneys for the Plaintiff Commonwealth of  
Virginia ex rel. Jason S. Miyares, Attorney  
General*

**MARTY J. JACKLEY**

Attorney General  
State of South Dakota

/s/ Amanda Miiller

Amanda Miiller (SD Bar No. 4271)  
Deputy Attorney General  
*pro hac vice*  
1302 SD Hwy 1889, Suite 1  
Pierre, SD 57501-8501  
Telephone: (605) 773-3215  
[amanda.miiller@state.sd.us](mailto:amanda.miiller@state.sd.us)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of South Dakota*

**JOHN B. MCCUSKLEY**

Attorney General  
State of West Virginia

/s/ Laurel K. Lackey

Laurel K. Lackey (WVSB No. 10267),  
*pro hac vice*  
Abby G. Cunningham (WVSB No. 13388)  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Office of the Attorney General  
Consumer Protection & Antitrust Division  
Eastern Panhandle Office  
269 Aikens Center  
Martinsburg, West Virginia 25404  
(304) 267-0239  
[laurel.k.lackey@wvago.gov](mailto:laurel.k.lackey@wvago.gov)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of West Virginia,  
ex rel. Patrick Morrissey, Attorney General*

**NICHOLAS W. BROWN**  
Attorney General State of Washington

/s/ Claire McNamara  
Claire McNamara (WA Bar No. 50097)  
Gardner Reed (WA Bar No. 55630)  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Washington State Office of the Attorney General  
800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000  
Seattle, WA 98104  
(206) 340-6783  
[claire.mcnamara@atg.wa.gov](mailto:claire.mcnamara@atg.wa.gov)  
[gardner.reed@atg.wa.gov](mailto:gardner.reed@atg.wa.gov)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Washington*

**JOSHUA L. KAUL**  
Attorney General  
State of Wisconsin

By: /s/ Brittany A. Copper  
Brittany A. Copper  
Assistant Attorney General  
WI State Bar # 1142446, *pro hac vice*  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
Post Office Box 7857  
Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7857  
Phone: (608) 261-9224  
Email: [Brittany.copper@wisdoj.gov](mailto:Brittany.copper@wisdoj.gov)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Wisconsin*

**ATTESTATION**

I, Verna Pradaxay, hereby attest, pursuant to N.D. Cal. Civil L.R. 5-1, that the concurrence to the filing of this document has been obtained from each signatory hereto.

DATED: November 19, 2025

/s/ Verna Pradaxay  
Deputy Attorney General  
New Jersey Office of the Attorney General,  
Division of Law  
124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor  
Newark, NJ 07101  
Tel: (973) 648-2052  
[Verna.Pradaxay@law.njoag.gov](mailto:Verna.Pradaxay@law.njoag.gov)